

DIGITALES ARCHIV

ZBW – Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft
ZBW – Leibniz Information Centre for Economics

Dimopoulos, Andreas

Article

"From studies to employment" : significant factors that apart from job market shortage affect graduates' employability : the importance of employability-soft skills

MIBES transactions

Provided in Cooperation with:

Technological Educational Institute (TEI), Thessaly

Reference: Dimopoulos, Andreas (2018). "From studies to employment" : significant factors that apart from job market shortage affect graduates' employability : the importance of employability-soft skills. In: MIBES transactions 12 (1), S. 37 - 55.

This Version is available at:

<http://hdl.handle.net/11159/2845>

Kontakt/Contact

ZBW – Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft/Leibniz Information Centre for Economics
Düsternbrooker Weg 120
24105 Kiel (Germany)
E-Mail: [rights\[at\]zbw.eu](mailto:rights[at]zbw.eu)
<https://www.zbw.eu/econis-archiv/>

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Dieses Dokument darf zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden. Sie dürfen dieses Dokument nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, aufführen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen. Sofern für das Dokument eine Open-Content-Lizenz verwendet wurde, so gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte.
<https://zbw.eu/econis-archiv/termsfuse>

Terms of use:

This document may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes. You are not to copy it for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the document in public, to perform, distribute or otherwise use the document in public. If the document is made available under a Creative Commons Licence you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the licence.

**'From studies to employment'
Significant factors that apart from job
market shortage affect graduates'
employability. The importance of
employability-soft skills**

Dimopoulos Andreas

Department of Economics
Political, Social and Economical Sciences Faculty
Democritus University of Thrace
job1j@yahoo.gr

Abstract

Employability affected from number of factors such as education and studies, personality, work experience, demographic attributes, skills and abilities. This paper explores and presents the relative impact between studies and soft skills as significant contribution factors which each one separately affect graduates' employability. Soft-employability skills seem to be more important to employers and have higher influence to their decisions, during employee selection process. The results are based on an extended literature review supported with primary empirical research, in both recruiters and graduates. From the answers of the respondents from both samples is clear that soft skills of candidates have a greater impact to their employability outcomes as well as to the decisions of employers during a hiring process.

Keywords: employability, unemployment, skills, education

JEL Classification Codes: J64, J48 I25, J21, J24, M51

Introduction

Studies and transition to employability

Good quality basic education is closely linked to economic development, despite the fact that it cannot be assumed that followed entirely from this. Such an education both in an initiative stage as during someone's life is of fundamental importance for further skills development which are beneficial to employment. Increases continuously the awareness that the development of skills through training, whether at school or elsewhere, is a key ingredient as a supplement to the general training and equipping people to grab the opportunities in the world of work ILO (2011). The process of transition from the stage of studies to the labour market, especially for young people, is of particular importance for employability and increasing interest for

students. How to find a job after college is a big concern, care for today's students, which dictates the international choices of student' very much. The opportunities for work and acquiring money during studies, is of more interest for non-EU students. Per A. Nilsson., N. Ripmeester (2016). It is therefore of particular importance for all stake holders to understand the variables that contribute to enhancing the employability of graduates and especially those of required skills and studies that contribute in this direction.

Definition of Employability and employability skills

People are more employable when they have a more expanded basic education and training, basic and transferable high-level skills, including teamwork, problem solving ability, but also skills in information and communication technologies and communication and language skills. This combination of skills, competencies enables the adaptation to changes occurring in the world of work ILO (2013). Employability is perceived as the possess of core skills or as an expanded set of generic attributes, or properties where a specific type of employers (company, sector, legislation) puts or specifies. The concept of employability depends not solely on the forces of the labour market, but also on other factors such as for example the willingness, ability, mobility, increased skills, operational flexibility in changing shifts and the ability to work someone beyond a narrow job description. Ultimately employability is someone's ability to be employable Misra and Mishra (2011)

A different approach to the concept of employability was given by the Harvey and Knight (2005, p. 5) according to whom this can be separated into two general dimensions. Employability in the sense of obtaining employment and employability in the sense of developing the skills of graduates. Note that the first approach is problematic in academia while in the second the academics can have a contribution. Thus according to Harvey and Knight (2005, p.5) the concept of employability refers to traits of graduates which help them to acquire, retain and develop a job. According to the research of G. Maxwell, et al (2009) through the 'distillation' of other relevant studies, employability skills are those of communication, decision making, autonomy at work, information management, leadership skills, number processing skills, personal learning and development, problem-solving skills, strategy and teamwork, highlighting in their

investigation the importance placed by employers in these skills of graduates. Most important among them ranked the skills in communication and problem solving. Thus it is well understood and supported that employability has to do with skills, abilities and attributes of candidates which are in relation and can be acquired not only from studies but also from other sources for example courses, work experience, society, family and many others.

Skills mismatch phenomenon and the importance of employability skills

In recent surveys employers reported shortages of graduates in subjects' generally in labour prudence, as is for example the trade awareness, perception, understanding the market in general, the teamwork and the maturity CBI.,(2011a); CIHE.,(2010) as well as the lack of relevant work experience, CBI (2011a).Hernandez-March et al(2009) have highlighted the skills required by the labour market of university graduates, and the mismatch which may exist in the requirements of employers and alumni. Among these abilities what deserve more the employers are the specialized technical knowledge as well as interpersonal skills. Ramlee Mustapha B., (2002) points out in his research that the employers of manufacturing industry in Malaysia consider that graduates' of technical faculties hold highly adequate technical skills, but fall short in skills such as motivation, interpersonal, problem solving, critical thinking and entrepreneurship. Syed Hussain and Syed Husman, (2005) found that a 60% rate of graduates of technical schools are still unemployed because they lack these job skills rather than technical skills required by the industry. Mohamed Rashid, et al (2005) respectively found in their research that graduates of polytechnics faculties in Malaysia is at 50.5% jobless rate for almost nine months of the year, due to the lack of these employability skills. Kathleen, C.,(2005) accordingly found in research on U.S. technical school graduates, that employers were not satisfied with the candidates, not because graduates did not possess enough technical knowledge and skills, but because they did not possess sufficient non-technical skills. In a similar survey in Pakistan Rao, A., et al. (2011), spotlighted the gap between employers and graduates regarding the required skills. Specifically recognized that employers usually choose only those candidates who have practical knowledge through the business environment as well as candidates with higher skill levels associated

with presentations. In another research Dafou (2009) examined the value of university degrees from the side of employers in Greece, mapping the links considered to exist between aspects of graduate's education and qualifications sought on the labour market. She found that no matter what methods are used by businesses to assess candidates for recruitment, information about applicants taken from aspects of academic experience, technical expertise, personality and personal motivation. In several areas at the global level, a large number of graduates have lack of employment skills that employers are asking for Rasul, M.S., et al., (2012). Indeed it is thought that graduates often do not possess the required soft skills and not the technical skills they need for employment, thus causing an 'illness' situation for their preparation to neater in job market Ramakrishnan, K. and Yasin, N.M.,(2010).The gap which exist between the business and academic community creates problems' in universities to recognize and to provide appropriate and requisite qualifications to potential employees graduates. The findings of the study of Mohamad Osmani et al.,(2015) showed that the development of the curriculum of higher education should be geared, shifted to characteristics and skills of graduates, which is expected from the industry and the market and is about the needs of them. Universities should try to work together with professional associations, which provide templates and guidelines on good practice of education of graduates. Mohamad Osmani et al.,(2015).The above statements coincide with the ongoing concern of employers about the mismatch and inconsistence between the skills held by graduates upon completion of their studies to those needed by employers. These include specific with location technical skills and employability skills CBI, (2011a); Archer & Davison, (2008). As the working environment today is in a constant shifting state with many changes, employees must be able to adapt in these changing situations by developing skills in communication, critical thinking, problem solving, and also to possess technical and academic knowledge that employers seek Moradi, M.A. (2011).The competitive employee is one who has skills in problem solving, can handle unpredictable and non-routine situations, without necessarily addressed to the administration for guidance, has knowledge which underpinned on the principle that this knowledge should applied to the work, as also knows how this knowledge can be applied in different situations Hammer(1996,p.47). The emphasis is on mutual obligations between

employers and employees and their common responsibility for developing and maintaining these general competencies as opposed to the past more traditional view of more specific skills focused on a business, and this new perspective on the world of work is for workers to think of themselves more as 'self-employed' than as a worker in a particular business Garavan, (1999).

'Comparative contribution among soft and hard skills to employability

The literature review showed that employers give emphasis on the skills of graduates in the selection process and less attention to their qualifications. Finch, et al.,(2013) conducted a survey to discover the factors that affect the employability of university graduates. Seventeen occurred factors were grouped into five broader categories. They found that employers give more importance to ability of someone to collaborate and interact in harmony with others such as teamwork skills and less attention to the reputation of the academic institution from which they graduated. The same argument noted from Scott., (2007) who found that employers actively seek the soft skills in the process of recruitment, and in some cases rank these soft skills higher than the easily measurable qualifications of so-called 'hard' skills. To the same direction is the opinion and belief from Raybould and Sheedy.,(2005, p. 259) who indicate that employers give great importance on employability skills, soft skills acquired by candidates during their studies and periods of work experience. In North America a Canadian investigation Finch et al., (2013), ends up stating that employers are primarily interested in five specific employability properties which are 'soft' skills such as effective communication and interpersonal skills, conflict resolution such as critical thinking, work experience acquired before their graduation, operational skills such as specific knowledge for the job and the academic distinction-reputation as the degree classification and reputation of the University. In the article of El Mansour, B. and Dean, J.C.,(2016) recorded the results of their research on employment skills of graduates of the school of management and human resource development, as they are perceived both by alumni themselves and by employers. The sample of the survey includes participants from the United States, European countries, and Morocco with the attribute of graduates of Human Resources Development Faculties, as well as employers who selected these graduates for jobs posts in their

businesses. The research studied the significance of employability skills from both sides participating. Skills which surveyed, recorded in common as important from three Continents. These were overall (18) eighteen and are the skills in learning (knowing how to learn), skills in communication, creativity, skills in problem solving, interpersonal skills, leadership skills, presentation skills, skills in the use of technologies, the skill to be able to work as part of a team, skills in strategic planning, customer management skills, change management skills, skills in foreign communication languages, digital competency, the skill in cultural awareness and expression, skills in taking initiatives and entrepreneurship, planning and organizing skills, self-management skills. The result of their research was that with the exception of skills in communication and in the use of technology all other were considered important by both sides of the participants. The paradox of lesser significance of these two skills in relation to the results of other researchers is well explained by the fact that in Morocco (21 participants in total of 72 in their sample), a country under development, skill in the use of technologies and communicative skills not currently perceived as important skills that lead to employment, because of the limited still use of technology in education and the development of human resources. Another explanation is that in general technology hasn't yet a large access and broader usage in businesses in this country. This research also shows that human resource development schools and their academic programs respectively, provide these skills correspond largely to the needs of employers. The skills that employers are looking for in the selection of candidates are related more on behavioral attributes and soft skills and less on formal qualifications. So it is understood that qualifications are often necessary but not effective and capable by themselves for successfully job find Johnson and Burden.,(2003). The so-called 'hard skills' of candidates are important and necessary, but not capable for success in the selection interview process for their recruitment. In his research Nilsson, S.,(2010) found that for engineers' graduates' who entering the labour market in Sweden the importance of formal and technical occupational skills diminishes. In this general context soft personal qualities and traits such as leadership skills and interpersonal skills are most important in terms of employment Aamodt, P., et al(2010).In the research of Weib.J. and Schuck B.,(2016) the consistent and universal answer both from

employers and interviewers was that soft abilities of candidates considered as more important than those of most hard skills. For example, it was pointed out that candidates must have the willingness to work, because the defects in their 'hard' skills unlike any personal weaknesses can be corrected, compensated more easily. In conclusion, having the required so-called hard skills, soft skills are obviously more important among the selection criteria. Garavan, (1999); Lips-Wiersma and M. Wright.,(2012); Weib and Schuck.,(2016)

Studies and employment

Having a degree (Bachelor of science) were once considered a major differentiator advantage in the labour market while today often considered as basic, minimum requirement in many tasks according to Brooks & Everett, (2009). As a result of the above finding many graduates increasingly participating in strategies which consider that will provide them with a competitive advantage in the job market, including taking a job as a practice exercise, attend additional curricula and continue to further studies such as postgraduate programs Morgan,(2012);Brooks & Everett.,(2009).As a consequence as the number of graduates is multiplied rapidly, competition for the jobs that require high levels of qualification becomes more intensive Baciú, E. and Lazar, T.,(2011)

But despite the fact that there are significant indications that through training and augmentation of additional study can enhance the possibility for employment of people in the labour market, however, unemployment levels remain high for the new people with elevated qualifications, especially in developing countries Baciú, E. and Lazar, T.,(2011). In support of this situation there is a reference in another investigation that particularly high academic qualifications are negatively associated with successfully finding jobs, stating so indirectly, that employability skills are comparatively more important in successfully job find, or that there is a perception on a part of employers that those who have high academic qualifications and hard skills may not easily accept positions that they themselves consider that they don't fit on them McQuaid., (2006).

According to Fallows and Steven.,(2000)higher education institutions have a special responsibility in employability skills development whereby should provide graduates with those, in order to work

effectively in an environment that is characterized as a society of learning or generation of learning. In his research Eisner, S., (2010) indicates that higher education can provide the 'path' in employment of graduates by developing relevant knowledge, skills and attitudes that employers want in the workplace. Up to now graduates of educational institutions are facing increased competition from more experienced workers, decreased level of recruitment, increased demands from employers for skills and an increasing global current workers tank which leads to an even more challenging and uncertain job market. The University also has a significant role and responsibility in the development of so-called employability skills A. Litchfield, J. Frawley, and S. Nettleton., (2010). Graduates of universities and employers are jointly responsible and must jointly act to develop employability skills. Thus, it can be seen and supported that the development of these skills should be guided by the needs of employers in accordance to Leitch (2006).

Research methodology

For the study of this research questions on relevant contribution to candidate's employability among the factor studies and employability skills factor, I conducted primary field research, in a sample of (130) hundred and thirty people men and woman, who surveyed as graduates, post graduate students, and students in various courses of Greek educational institutions. As employability we refer to those factors which are able to change the probability of someone to enter to the labor market, or to help someone to find a new job, or to improve his/her existent job position according to McQuaid & Lindsay (2005); De Grip et al., (2004). A structured questionnaire with likert scale used, asking the opinion of participants in order to measure the extent to which they have acquired or developed the necessary transferable-soft skills from their studies, as well as their perception regarding the contribution of studies to their employability outcomes. For this purpose i relied on the research of Lee Harvey., (2001) according to whom employability is the attributes and personal qualities and employability-core skills of graduates and therefore the effectiveness of a Higher Educational Institute respectively, would be the chances that graduates had into this institute and it's curriculums to develop such skills and attributes. The questionnaires' were delivered hand by hand to respondents in

order to have the time and the chance to be explained any of questions that they might had. The questionnaires' were validated and piloted prior to the distribution. Respondents participated were from various areas mainly from universities of Thessaloniki, and Higher Technological Institute of Kozani and Thessaly between in the period of September 2017 to June 2018. Participants were asked via structured questionnaire to evaluate among other items the contribution of their under graduate and post graduate studies both in terms of enhancing their employability and strengthening their employability skills as well. To set the employability skills i relied on a number of studies such as ILO (2008), ILO (2013), B. Mansur & J. Dean (2016), G. Maxwell et al., (2009) in order to set and list the most common used of these skills. Furthermore in another relevant research i studied the opinions of employers on the relative affect between studies and employability skills of candidates regarding their decisions during a personnel selection process relying on the research of B. Mansur & J. Dean (2016) who studied the opinions of employers if the academic programs that graduates attended meets the requirements of employers in terms of their employability skills who have acquired. Another similar research in which I have relied is that of Mahbub Sarkar et al., (2016) who have studied the importance of employability skills and the contribution of studies on them according to employers' and graduates opinions. The sample consisted of two hundred and sixty (260) participants' men and woman, included employers', personnel directors, professional recruitment consultants and executives who have authority in the recruitment of employees from different areas of work and different Greek geographical areas.

Employability interpretation needs a common framework

The interpretation of the term employability towards the results of a process which leads to this is confusing. Hillage and Pollard, (1998) The connection of the term for example with studying is likely to continue to be the subject of measurement results, as for example the quantity, or the number of graduates who manages to find a full-time job within a certain time period. The current emphasis in the program of 'national' and employability skills development is not a new concern for agencies, institutes that provide education, or those who formulate policies Cranmer, (2006).The issue indeed is now a firmly established policy for governments and higher education institutions

Lees, (2002) and probably has never been more interesting than today Rae,(2007);Treleaven & Voola,(2008).Due to different factors apart from the skills that affect employability and the many definitions about this, is proposed a frame work which include all them in a 'common frame language' so that would be a more clear definition of the concept about the skills associated with it Goodwin, S., et al.,(2012).Respectively in their study McQuaid, R.W, and Lindsay, C (2005) indicate that the interpretation of the term employability and job skills assessment should be done in a broader approach that includes parameters associated with individual characteristics such as a person attributes that makes him or her unemployable, family, social, economic situations and external parameters affecting employability, such as range of labour demand, support from public employment services, which all of them interact in the same system.

Measuring the effectiveness of HEI towards graduates' employability

Several models have been developed from researchers to measure and asses the competitiveness of the applicants' such as the employability skills who acquired Jackson, D.,(2014), their readiness for employment, the cumulative assessed related knowledge of Alumni candidates, their ability to apply such skills in the job, and their character i.e. to work efficiently either on their own or with others in groups O'Leary (2013); O'Leary (2012).The research of Creasey., (2013) confirms that employers need graduates with strong education, proven, practical skills and personal qualities of character. In his research Tran.,(2015) argued that the old-fashioned-anachronistic and irrelevant curriculum in higher education system has led to poor preparation of university graduates to job market.

Higher educational institutions compete at national and international level, especially in new effectiveness indicators which appear, including the index of employability of graduates. Smith, McKnight., and Naylor.,(2000). An indicator of the effectiveness of Higher Educational Institute in employability aims to demonstrate the efficiency of this institution in the development of skilled graduates to employment. This measure of effectiveness will be different depending on the definition we give in the concept of employability., Lee Harvey., (2001). If we choose the definition that employability is finding a job, then the effectiveness of an educational institute could be the proportion of graduates who found work.If we choose the

definition that employability are the features and qualities of candidates, then the efficiency of an educational institute could be the control of developing opportunities and improvement in these particular features provided to graduates by the institute. Specific actions can be measures and assessment of the degree to which students of a particular curriculum have developed, improve the necessary, appropriate properties and characteristics. If we choose the definition that employability is the satisfaction of students, then the efficiency of an institute could be a survey questionnaire of student satisfaction index by program studies, provided by the Institute, or the degree for preparation for the labour market and the reflection of these skills. In fact the model of employability is rather more complicated. Higher education institutions provide a range of opportunities for development of the employability of their students, including the improvement of their characteristics, properties, the development of self- presentations skills, encourage them to love and desire learning and understanding of the need for continuous learning Lee Harvey.,(2001). A more practical alternative is to measure the extent to which students have opportunities for work experience and growth opportunities, improved due solely to their participation in the curriculum, and include job search skills. There is scope for 'extended' control over the overall student experience, which may include student assessment about whether the educational methods and techniques contribute to the improvement of their employability skills Lee Harvey.,(2001). In Europe in European Education Ministers meeting, Ministers of Education, (1999) had given particular emphasis in higher education results in terms of employability criteria and the respective skills. The European Commission and national governments have risen as a topic and have issued a series of practices, legislation, and policies aimed at improving the skills of graduates and through them to the improvement of employability, employment indicators and competitiveness of the European Union. For this purpose has established the European Transportable System Credits (ECTS), National and European Qualifications Framework for Higher Education (QF-EHEA), the EQF-LLL system for life-long Learning and various surveys and reports EC,(2008); Cedefop,(2013), Lokhoff, et al.,(2010) designed to support, to introduce and develop the employability skills within the Universities.

Conclusions and suggestions

The employability of a candidate on the labour market can be improved. According to International Labor Organization ILO,(2011) more closed cooperation between business, Government, and educational institutions, with local industry in national level, is an effective mean and way to ensure the relevance of education to the necessary changes in business and demands of labour market. This cooperation between the stake holders is indispensable and imperative if we want to strengthen the employability of graduates of universities and not only them. Employees and employers can work together in common, so that the workers can develop a range of generic, transferable skills, such as those of communication, interpersonal skills, problem solving skills, team collaboration and decision-making skills Lips-Wiersma & Wright,(2012). In his research Tran.,(2015) propose that everyone involved, including universities, alumni, employers and those who design training policies, should work together in order to try to develop a mutual understanding, to collaborate, and to enhance the employability of graduates.

Many young people encounter difficulties in finding employment because of inconsistency between education they have received and the different requirements of the labour market. There is an imperative need to equip our young workers and new entrants to job market with skills that are essential to the work of the future, without neglecting and forgetting the value of resupplied the manpower working today with those skills which are necessary to them, so that they can continue to work ILO (2012). An effective policy that aims to develop and equip the work force of a country with human resources skills would be the wider availability and better quality of education, as a foundation for continued learning, better reconciliation between the skills of workers as labour supply in required needs in those on the business side, the ability of workers and enterprises to adapt to changes in technology and markets, detecting and preparing for the new skills that will be needed for the future.

As best practices in the above objective can be considered the practical experience in students through internships, encouraging student mobility while study, designed curriculums which aim at development of soft skills, specialized training on job search methods and interview success response, consulting and mentoring programs, the

exploitation of new information technologies with focus on employability and job market issues and closer collaboration between all stakeholders such as employers, universities, and other public and private bodies associated with employment. These practices have proven to have a significant positive impact on the graduates' employability outcomes and there is an opportunity for further study on them and to be presented in a next article.

References

- Aamodt, P., Hovdhaugen, E. and Bielfeldt, U, 2010 "Serving the Society"? Historical and Modern Interpretations of Employability. Higher Education Policy, 23, 271-284. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1057/hep.2010>
- Archer, W., and J. Davison. 2008, "Graduate Employability: The View of Employers". London: The Council for Industry and Higher Education. aces.shu.ac.uk/employability/resources/0802grademployability.pdf.
- Baciu, E. and Lazar, T. 2011, "Skills Supply and Skills Demand Among Youth: Object of Concern or Object of Hope"? Revista De Asistentă Socială, 4, 85-101.
- Brooks, R., & Everett, G. 2009, "Post-graduation reflections on the value of a degree". British Educational Research Journal, 35 (3), 333-349.
- CBI. 2011a, "Building for growth": business priorities for education and skills. Retrieved 5 February 2015 from: http://www.cbi.org.uk/media/1051530/cbi__edi_education__skills_survey_2011.pdf
- Cedefop 2013, "On the way to 2020": data for vocational education and training policy, Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2013, [online], last accessed on 19 September 2014 at: <http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Index.aspx>
- Cranmer, S. 2006, "Enhancing graduate employability: Best intentions and mixed outcomes". Studies in Higher Education, 31, 168-184. doi:10.1080/03075070600572041
- Creasey, R. 2013, "Improving Students' Employability." *Engineering Education* 8 (1): 16-30.
- Dafou, E. 2009, "Qualifications and skills: The organisational perspective". Journal of Education and Work, 22, 91-104.
- De Grip A, Van Loo J, Sanders J (2004), The industry employability index: taking account of supply and demand characteristics. *Int Labour Rev* 143 (3): 211-233
- EC 2008, "New Skills for New Jobs, Anticipating and matching labour market and skills needs", Brussels, COM(2008) 868/3
- Eisner, S. 2010, "Grave New World? Workplace Skills for Today's College Graduates", *American Journal of Business Education*, 3, 27-50.
- El.Mansour, B., and Dean, J.C. 2016, "Employability Skills as Perceived by Employers and University Faculty in the Fields of Human Resource Development (HRD) for Entry Level Graduate Jobs". *Journal of Human*

- Resource and Sustainability Studies, 4, 39-49.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/jhrss.2016.41005>
- European Ministers of Education, 1999, "The Bologna Declaration". Bologna Berlin 2003, de/pdf/bologna declaration.pdf.
- Fallows, S., & Steven, C. 2000, "Building employability skills into the higher education curriculum": A university-wide initiative. Education + Training, 42, 75-82. doi:10.1108/00400910010331620
- Finch, D. J., L. K. Hamilton, R. Baldwin, and M. Zehner. 2013, "An Exploratory Study of Factors Affecting Undergraduate Employability". Education + Training 55 (7): 681-704.
- Garavan, T. 1999, "Employability, the emerging new deal"? Journal of European Industrial Training, 23 (1)
- Gillian Maxwell, Bernadette Scott, Dorothy Macfarlane and Elizabeth Williamson 2009, "Employers as stakeholders in postgraduate employability skills development". International Journal of Management Education 8(2)
- Goodwin, S., McDonald, R., Perkins, K., Wignall, L., Gale, G., O'Callaghan, K., Murray, F., McGraw, J., Redman, K. and Hopwood, J. 2012, "Employability Skills Framework": Stage 1 Final Report
- Hammer, M. 1996, "Beyond Reengineering", London, Harper Collins Business
- Harvey L., 2001. "Defining and Measuring Employability" Quality in Higher Education, Vol. 7, No. 2, 2001
- Harvey, L., & Knight, P.T. 2005, "Briefings on employability 5: Helping departments to develop employability". York, England: ESECT
- Hernández-March, J., Martín del Peso, M., & Leguey, S. 2009, "Graduates' skills and higher education: The employers' perspective". Tertiary Education and Management, 15(1), 1-16.
- HILLAGE, J. & POLLARD, E. 1998, "Employability: Developing a Framework for Policy Analysis". In: DEPARTMENT FOR EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT (ed.) Research Brief No. 85.
- International Labour Organization ILO 2011, "A Skilled Workforce for Strong, Sustainable and Balanced Growth" A G20 Training Strategy
- International Labour Organization ILO 2013, "Enhancing youth employability: What? Why? And How? Guide to core work skills" -HRD Recommendation 195, 2004; this was reinforced in the Resolution of Youth Employment 2005
- International Labour Organization. ILO 2012, "The Youth Employment Crisis": Highlights of the 2012 ILC report.
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ed_emp_msu/documents/publication/wcms_181269.pdf
- Jackson, D. 2014a, "Testing a model of undergraduate competence in employability skills and its implications for stakeholders". Journal of Education and Work, 27, 220-242.
- Johnson. S and Burden. T 2003, "Young people, employability and the induction process". Joseph Rowntree Foundation, Policy Research Institute, Leeds Metropolitan University
- Kathleen, C., 2005, "Developing Employability Skills". Regional Educational Laboratory, School Improvement Research Series (SIRS).
- Lees, D. 2002, "Graduate employability literature review". Retrieved January 12, 2009, from <http://www.palatine.ac.uk/files/emp/1233.pdf>

- Leitch, S. 2006, "Leitch review of skills: Prosperity for all in the global economy – world class skills". Norwich, England: HMSO.
- Lips-Wiersma & M., Wright, S. 2012, "Measuring the Meaning of Meaningful Work": Development and Validation of the Comprehensive Meaningful Work Scale (CMWS), *Group & Organization Management*, 37 (5), 655-685
- Litchfield A., Frawley J., and Nettleton S. 2010, "Contextualizing and Integrating into the Curriculum the Learning and Teaching of Work-Ready Professional Graduate Attributes", *Higher Education Research & Development*, Routledge, pp. 519-534
- Mahbub Sarkar, Tina Overton, Christopher Thompson and Gerry Rayner, 2016, *Graduate Employability: Views of Recent Science Graduates and Employers*. *International Journal of Innovation in Science and Mathematics Education*, 24(3), 31-48
- McQuaid Ronald W 2006, "Job search success and employability in local labor markets" *Ann RegSci*40:407-421 Springer -Verlag
- McQuaid, R.W. and Lindsay, C. 2005, "The Concept of Employability". *Urban Studies*, 42, 197-219.<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0042098042000316100>
- Misra, K. R. & Mishra, P. 2011, "Employability Skills: The Conceptual Framework & Scale Development", *The Indian Journal of Industrial Relations*, 46 (4), 650-660
- Mohamad Osmani, Vishanth Weerakkody, Nitham M. Hindi, Rajab Al-Esmail, Tillal Eldabi, Kawaljeet Kapoor & Zahir Irani (2015) Identifying the trends and impact of graduate attributes on employability: a literature review, *Tertiary Education and Management*, 21:4, 367-379, DOI: 10.1080/13583883.2015.1114139
- Mohamed Rashid Navi Bax and Mohd Rashahidi Mohamood, (2005), "The Year 2004 Polytechnic Convocation Survey". *Proceedings of National Seminar on The Development of Technology And Technical-Vocational Education And Training In An Era of Globalization: Trend and Issues*. Kuala Lumpur.
- Moradi, M.A. 2011, "A Case Study of How Students Enrolled in CTE Programs and Faculty Understand and Assess the Implications of Globalization on Career Preparation". Ph. D. Thesis, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo
- Morgan, M.J.L. 2012, "Understanding the learning and teaching expectations of taught postgraduate students across science, engineering and computing subjects at Kingston University (KU)". *Higher Education Academy*. York.
- Nilsson P. A., and Ripmeester N., 2016, "International Student Expectations: Career Opportunities and Employability". *Journal of International Students*, Volume 6, Issue 2 pp. 614-631
- Nilsson, S. 2010, "Enhancing Individual Employability: The Perspective of Engineering Graduates". *Education+Training*, 52, 540-551. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/00400911011068487>
- O'Leary, S. 2012, "Impact of Entrepreneurship Teaching in Higher Education on the Employability of Scientists and Engineers." *Industry and Higher Education* 26 (6): 431-442.

- O'Leary, S. 2013, "Collaborations in Higher Education with Employers and Their Influence on Graduate Employability: An Institutional Project." *Enhancing Learning in the Social Sciences* 5 (1): 37-50.
- Rae, D. 2007, "Connecting Enterprise and Graduate Employability: Challenges to the Higher Education Culture and Curriculum?" *Education + Training* 49 (8/9): 605-619.
- Ramakrishnan, K. and Yasin, N.M. 2010, "Knowledge Management Portal: Connecting Higher Learning Institution and Employer" *Journal of Data Mining and Knowledge Discovery*, 1, 1-18.
- Ramlee b. Mustapha, 2002, "The role of vocational and technical education in the industrialization of Malaysia as perceived by educators and employers" Doctoral Dissertation, Purdue University.
- Rao, A., Shah, S., Aziz, J., Jaffari, A., Ejaz, W., Ul-Haq, I. and Raza, S. 2011, "Employability in MNCs: Challenge for Graduates". *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 3, 189-200.
- Rasul, M.S., Rauf, R.A.A., Mansor, A.N and Puvanasvaran, A.P. 2012, "Employability Skills Assessment Tool" Development. *International Education Studies*, 5, 43-56. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ies.v5n5p43>
- Raybould, J., & Sheedy, V. 2005, "Are graduates equipped with the right skills in the employability stakes"? *Industrial and Commercial Training*, 37, 259-263. doi:10.1108/00197850510609694
- Scott, B. 2007, "The BAA/GCU Scottish Ambassadors Program (2003-2005): The student/airport Interface". *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 19, 221-233. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/09596110710739921>
- Smith, J., McKnight, A, and Naylor, R. 2000, "Graduate Employability: Policy and Performance in Higher Education in the UK." *The Economic Journal* 110: F382-411
- Syed Hussain Syed Husman, 2005, "Meeting The Needs of Employers". *Proceedings of National Seminar on The Development of Technology And Technical-Vocational Education And Training In An Era of Globalization: Trend and Issues*, Kuala Lumpur
- Tran, T. T. 2015, "Is graduate employability the whole-of-higher-education-issue"? *Journal of Education and Work*, 28, 207-227
- Treleaven, L., & Voola, R. 2008, "Integrating the development of graduate attributes through constructive alignment". *Journal of Marketing Education*, 30, 160-173. doi: 10.1177/0273475308319352
- Lokhoff, et al., (2010), (Eds), "A Tuning Guide to Formulating Degree Programme Profiles including Programme Competences and Programme Learning Outcomes. European Commission, Education and Culture
- Weib, J., and Schuck B., 2016, "First Findings from Employer Interviews 'Cultural Pathways to Economic Self-Sufficient and Entrepreneurship': Family Values and Youth Unemployment in Europe (CUPESS) Working Paper No 05

Appendix 1:

Questionnaire of candidates

To what extent do you think that your undergraduate studies, improved, or developed your employability skills?														
Increasing the chances of your integration into the labour market					Making it easier to find a new job					Update the job post you already own				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														
Transferable skills are defined as the wider, general those skills that are necessary not only to get a job but to remain in employment. Communication, Teamwork, problem solving, initiative and enterprise, planning and organizing, self-management, self-learning, technology skills														

To what extent do you think that your undergraduate studies contribute effectively to enhancing or improving your employability outcomes?														
Increasing the chances of your integration into the labour market					Making it easier to find a new job					Update the job post you already own				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

To what extent do you think the program of post graduate studies that track, improve or develop your employability skills?														
Increasing the chances of your integration into the labour market					Making it easier to find a new job					Update the job post you already own				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

To what extent do you think the program of post graduate studies that track, improve or develop your employability outcomes?														
Increasing the chances of your integration into the labour market					Making it easier to find a new job					Update the job post you already own				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

To what extent do you think the program of graduate studies that track, contribute effectively to the strengthening or improvement of your gaining greater self-confidence;														
Increasing the chances of your integration into the labour market					Making it easier to find a new job					Update the job post you already own				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														
Self-confidence is defined as the personal opinion of the candidate that is able to have that behavior and activity required in order to achieve the desired result in the labour search														

Appendix 2:
Questionnaire of Employers, recruiters, managers'

When you select a candidate using the method of interview for a job post, how much importance do you attach to the following standard of qualifications in order to:

If his/her educational level is:	Hire him/her					Consider him/her suitable for the position					Give him/her a chance for a second interview				
Vocational Training Institute	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
University/Higher Technical Institute	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
Postgraduate master's degree	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
If he report a high degree	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
If he/she reports academic distinctions (scholarships)	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
If he/her Bachelor specialty is relevant to the position you want to cover	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
If he/her Bachelor specialty is unrelated to the position you want to cover	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5

When you select a candidate using the method of interview for a job post, how much importance do you attach to average rating of the degree in order to:

Hire him/her					Consider him/her suitable for the position					Give him/her a chance for a second interview				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

When you select a candidate using the method of interview for a job post, how much importance do you attach to his/her employability skills in order to:

Hire him/her					Consider him/her suitable for the position					Give him/her a chance for a second interview				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

Transferable skills are defined as the wider, general those skills that are necessary not only to get a job but to remain in employment. Communication, Teamwork, problem solving, initiative and enterprise, planning and organizing, self-management, self-learning, technology skills.

When you select a candidate using the method of interview for a job post, how much importance do you attach to his/her work industriousness' in order to:

Hire him/her					Consider him/her suitable for the position					Give him/her a chance for a second interview				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														

As 'industriousness' is the work history of the applicant in relation to the meaning of hard work and his attitude expressed about the opinion that hard work is an important element in life

When you select a candidate using the method of interview for a job post, how much importance do you attach to his/her self confidence in order to:

Hire him/her					Consider him/her suitable for the position					Give him/her a chance for a second interview				
1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5	1	2	3	4	5
1= not at all 2= to a minimum 3= to some degree 4= to a great degree 5= in extremely large degree														
Self-confidence is defined as the personal opinion of the candidate for the degree or extent of his skills.														